

# Research Journal of Pharmaceutical, Biological and Chemical Sciences

## Human resource management of healthcare organizations in Kazakhstan.

Baiganova Zh<sup>1\*</sup>, Dubitskiy A<sup>1</sup>, Mussina G<sup>2</sup>, and Koykov V<sup>2</sup>.

<sup>1</sup>Astana Medical University, Astana, Kazakhstan.

<sup>2</sup>Republican Center for Health Development, MoHSD of Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana.

### ABSTRACT

The question of efficiency of the human resources policy in medical organizations is still relevant at any healthcare financing scope and wage system. The aim of this study is to examine the opinion of the medical staff on the activities of HR services in healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan. A sociological survey was conducted by interviewing 6143 respondents from 16 regions of Kazakhstan. The survey was conducted anonymously - using Survey Monkey online program. During the analysis of contingency tables the following statistical tests were used: Chi-square test, Cramer's V measuring strength of association, the standardized residuals. 34.3% of the respondents noted the necessity to improve efficiency of their work. 57.0% of respondents believed that their career growth depends on the decision of the employer, and possession of business skills and the attitude to work. 25.4% of respondents were ready to change their job for better working conditions. Our study showed the importance of improvement of human resources service taking into account development of motivational activities, as well as technical capabilities of the medical organization. Medical institutions in our country are in need of improvement of HR service technology.

**Keywords:** Human Resources management, performance of health service, motivation in healthcare, Kazakhstan.

*\*Corresponding author*

## INTRODUCTION

In the healthcare system, we are confronted with human resources of the clinical profile, as well as non-clinical profile, responsible for public and individual health intervention. [1] Performance of the medical organization depends on the knowledge, skills, abilities and motivation system of those responsible for the provision of health services. [2] According to Zurn P. et al. cultural, sociodemographic characteristics and economic factors are the most important elements when considering the demand for health services [3] Human resource management (HRM) must be developed in order to find the appropriate balance of the demand for health services and the corresponding capacity and effective practice of medical personnel, which meets the needs of the market. [4, 5] The issue on the efficiency of human resources policy of the medical organization is still relevant at any healthcare financing scope and wage system. New terms and conditions of functioning of the health system of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the light of its reforms impose new requirements to the potential of HR management, functions and responsibilities of which should be expanded.

The question of readiness of managers of health care organizations and human resources services becomes extremely important when making decisions in the management of the medical personnel, their direct activities in the formation of quality human resource capacity of medical and paramedical personnel. As it was observed in numerous studies that human resources management plays a significant role in developing the quality of healthcare service and improves the performance of individuals working in health organisation through incentives and 'motivation to work' tools as well as its "system of bonuses by competencies" [6, 7]. Motivating people - that means to affect their important interests, to create them conditions for the self-realization in the process of life.

Problems of medical personnel in modern health care confirm the importance of issues aimed at improving quality of medical care provided to the population through the creation of a favorable social and psychological conditions in health care organizations which will contribute to the creative potential of the staff, enhance their qualifications and, as a result - increase the efficiency of health care facilities and the health system as a whole.

**The aim** of this study is to examine the opinion of the medical staff on the activities of HR services in health care organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

## METHODS

Based on a literature review on issues of quality, equity and accessibility of primary health care, we developed a questionnaire. Respondents were asked to select the most appropriate option for their opinion regarding the asked question. The target groups were the employees of medical organizations, public and private health sector in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The survey was conducted anonymously - using online Survey Monkey program. Online database of addresses exists at the level of the Republican health development center.

The survey questionnaire was pilot tested and also checked by two independent reviewers. Its use was approved by Republican center for health development. The survey was conducted in the second quarter of 2016. We have conducted a sociological survey among 6143 respondents from 16 regions of Kazakhstan. The participation in this survey was confidential and voluntary.

The analysis and data processing were performed using the specialized data processing SPSS statistical software. During the analysis of contingency tables the following statistical tests were used: Chi-square test, Cramer's V measuring strength of association, the standardized residuals.

## RESULTS

Our study was participated by representatives of almost all types of health care organization, including the private health sector organizations working according to voluntary system of medical insurance (11.7%). A high percentage of the respondents represented organizations which provide inpatient care (31.8%), the lowest percentage of respondents (2.2%) presented the organizations of rehabilitation treatment and medical rehabilitation. The survey was participated by nursing staff 35.1%, administrative and managerial staff 22.1%, and 21.7% of clinical staff. According to demographic indicators among respondents, representatives of the female sex

(80.8%) dominated, compared with 19.2% male. According to age criteria, the majority of respondents were under the age of 35 years, and the smallest group represented the age range from 63 years (1.3%) (Table 1).

47.4% of respondents noted the effectiveness of HR service which uses modern HRM technology, whereas 34.3% of respondents pointed at a satisfactory level of work of HR service, which needs improvement in its efficiency (Table 1). 57.0% of respondents believed that their career growth depends on the decision of the head of the organization, including the possession of business skills and the attitude to work. 53% of the respondents marked that employee turnover in healthcare organisations is at the medium level, although the measures to retain employees are being taken 50.1%. (Table 1).

Respondents, which over the last 5 years have not changed the job amounted to 66.8%, those of respondents who have changed job 1 time - 25.0%, those who were not going to change their job 54.3%, and 25.4% of those who were willing to change their job under better working conditions (Table 1).

**Table 1 Characteristics of respondents and their evaluation of HR services**

Type of Health Organization	Number of medical organisations	
	Abs.	%
Organizations providing outpatient care	1191	19,4
Organizations providing inpatient care	1954	31,8
Organizations providing outpatient care and inpatient care	1580	25,7
Organizations emergency medical services and medical aviation	426	6,9
Organizations of rehabilitation treatment and medical rehabilitation	134	2,2
Organizations carrying out activities in the field of blood services	141	2,3
Organizations of the private health sector, working on a voluntary insurance scheme	717	11,7
Total:	6143	100
<b>What category of personnel you belong?</b>		
Administrative management	1358	22,1
Clinical staff with higher education	1333	21,7
Clinical staff with secondary education	2158	35,1
Ancillary staff	702	11,5
other	592	9,6
<b>Gender of respondents</b>		
female	4962	80,8
male	1181	19,2
<b>Age of respondents</b>		
less than 35	2378	38,7
35-44	1648	26,8
45-54	1428	23,2
55-63	612	10,0
63+	77	1,3
<b>How do you assess the work of human resource service (HR) of your organization?</b>		
Effective HR service that uses modern HR technology in its work	2913	47,4
HR Service is working satisfactorily, but there is a need to improve the efficiency of its work	2105	34,3
HR Service does not work well, no modern HR technology are applied	321	5,2
I do not know	784	12,8
Other (specify)	20	0,3
<b>How career development system is constructed within your organization?</b>		
It depends on the resolution of the chief, and the business skills of employees are not considered	642	10,5
It depends on the resolution of the chief, and business skills of employees and attitude to work are also considered	3500	57,0
It is made on a competitive basis, according to objective criteria	549	8,9
I do not know	1411	23,0
Other (specify)	41	0,7
How do you assess the level of staff turnover in your organization?		

High	723	11,8
Average	3281	53,4
Low	2139	34,8
<b>Are there any retention measures of employees applied in your organization?</b>		
Yes	3075	50,1
No	1386	22,6
I do not know	1682	27,4
Total:	<b>6143</b>	100
<b>How often have you changed jobs in the last 5 years?</b>		
Have not changed	4102	66,8
1 time	1537	25,0
2 times	389	6,3
3 or more	115	1,9
<b>Are you ready to change your job now?</b>		
Yes, I am currently in search of a more suitable place of work and (or) such thoughts visit me constantly	516	8,3
I do not think about it, but if it will be possible and meet my conditions (wages, position, etc.), I'll be ready to change the place of the work	1561	25,4
No, I'm not going change the place of work and no reason to do so	3341	54,3
Difficult to answer	676	11,2
Other	49	0,8
Total:	<b>6143</b>	100

The degree of satisfaction and the work of the respondents also showed a statistically proven relation between these variables (V Cramer was 0.151). Most respondents were not satisfied with the size of wages, access or the speed of the Internet and level of technical equipment at work. The greatest degree of satisfaction of respondents was expressed to the relationship with colleagues and immediate superiors (Table 2).

Evaluation of implemented by human resource policies and the degree of satisfaction of respondents also showed a statistically proven relation between the two variables (V Cramer was 0.06). According to the analysis of standardized residuals it can be seen that most of the respondents were not satisfied with HR policy, implemented by the Ministry of Health and Social Development. Respondents were very satisfied with the work of the management staff they are working with (Table 3).



**Table 2. Satisfaction of respondents with HR service activities**

		Satisfied	Rather satisfied than dissatisfied	Rather dissatisfied than satisfied	Not satisfied	Total	Chi-square test	Cramer's V
The size of earnings	Frequency	2925	925	682	819	5351	4276,91	0,151
	The expected frequency	4087,8	766,7	248,3	248,2	5351,0		
	Standardized residues	-18,2	5,7	27,5	36,2	-18,2		
Mode of operation	Frequency	4224	834	244	161	5463		
	The expected frequency	4173,3	782,8	253,5	253,4	5463,0		
	Standardized residues	,8	1,8	-,6	-5,8			
Compliance of the personal abilities	Frequency	4317	735	148	66	5266		
	The expected frequency	4022,8	754,6	244,3	244,3	5266,0		
	Standardized residues	4,6	-,7	-6,2	-11,4			
The possibility of continuous professional development	Frequency	3778	736	231	236	4981		
	The expected frequency	3805,1	713,7	231,1	231,0	4981,0		
	Standardized residues	-,4	,8	,0	,3			
Opportunity to officer promotion	Frequency	3358	729	216	298	4601		
	The expected frequency	3514,8	659,3	213,5	213,4	4601,0		
	Standardized residues	-2,6	2,7	,2	5,8			
Sanitary conditions	Frequency	4382	634	160	135	5311		
	The expected frequency	4057,2	761,0	246,4	246,3	5311,0		
	Standardized residues	5,1	-4,6	-5,5	-7,1			
The level of labor organization	Frequency	4094	784	213	136	5227		
	The expected frequency	3993,0	749,0	242,5	242,4	5227,0		
	Standardized residues	1,6	1,3	-1,9	-6,8			
Relationships with colleagues	Frequency	4750	561	90	39	5440		
	The expected frequency	4155,8	779,5	252,4	252,3	5440,0		
	Standardized residues	9,2	-7,8	-10,2	-13,4			
Relationship with supervisor	Frequency	4549	593	102	76	5320		
	The expected frequency	4064,1	762,3	246,8	246,8	5320,0		
	Standardized residues	7,6	-6,1	-9,2	-10,9			
Technical equipment	Frequency	3637	826	338	323	5124		
	The expected frequency	3914,4	734,2	237,7	237,7	5124,0		
	Standardized residues	-4,4	3,4	6,5	5,5			



Internet access and its speed	Frequency	3463	768	300	520	5051		
	The expected frequency	3858,6	723,8	234,4	234,3	5051,0		
	Standardized residues	-6,4	1,6	4,3	18,7			
Total	Frequency		8928	2891	2890	62307		
	The expected frequency		8928,0	2891,0	2890,0	62307,0		

**Table 3. Evaluation of HR policy of the respondents**

			Highly effective	Fairly effective	Insufficient	Low efficiency	Total	Chi-square test	Cramer's V
Establishment	Ministry of Health and Social Development	Frequency	1785	1945	492	237	4459	101,490 <sup>a</sup>	,060
		The expected frequency	1833,3	2013,0	411,5	201,1	4459,0		
		Standardized residues	-1,1	-1,5	4,0	2,5			
	Department of Health of the Region (city)	Frequency	1745	2055	452	234	4486		
		The expected frequency	1844,4	2025,2	414,0	202,4	4486,0		
		Standardized residues	-2,3	,7	1,9	2,2			
	Leadership of the organization in which you work	Frequency	2212	2305	345	159	5021		
		The expected frequency	2064,3	2266,7	463,4	226,5	5021,0		
		Standardized residues	3,2	,8	-5,5	-4,5			
Total	Frequency	5742	6305	1289	630	13966			
	The expected frequency	5742,0	6305,0	1289,0	630,0	13966,0			

## DISCUSSION

We have identified the lack of efficiency of HRM service activities (34.3%), which according to the respondents may lead to the increasing staff turnover (53.0%) and readiness of 25.0% personnel structure to change their job for better working conditions. Human Resource Management (also called processes) is usually led by the HR manager, who implements the goals and objective targets of the organization. And every staff from top to bottom working in any functional area of management such as production, finance and marketing has to perform its functions according to this HRM strategy. [6]

Most respondents were not satisfied with the size of wages, access to the Internet or the speed and level of technical equipment at work.

## CONCLUSION

There is an urgent need to improve the technology of HR service development in medical organisations of our country, which will take into account the development of motivational measures, as well as technical capabilities of the medical organization. For our national health care, which is undergoing a period of social and economic change, the problem of effective human resource management is particularly important, as the activities of medical personnel associated with patients requiring special attention and responsiveness at the expense of personal ambitions and habits of staff. This explains the fact that the medical staff is like no other at high risk of emotional burnout syndrome, which is manifested in the emotional and mental exhaustion and physical fatigue, the appearance of personal detachment and decrease of the degree of satisfaction from the executed work, therefore demotivation to working with patients. The head of the medical institution in his daily and future activities should consider that the efficiency of the entire organization depends on the interaction of socio-psychological, economic, personal, and other factors acting in a single complex for the successful decision of administrative problems.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would like to express gratitude to the staff of the observatory of human resources at the RSE on PVC "Republican Center for Health Development" Ministry of Health and Social Development of Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana

## REFERENCES

- [1] Ono T, Lafortune G, Schoenstein M. Health Workforce Planning in OECD Countries: A Review of 26 Projection Models from 18 Countries. 2013. Report No.: 62.
- [2] Stefane M Kabene, Carole Orchard, John M Howard, Mark A Soriano, Raymond Leduc The importance of human resources management in health care: a global context Hum Resour Health. 2006; 4: 20. Published online 2006 Jul 27. doi: 10.1186/1478-4491-4-20 PMID: PMC1552082.
- [3] Zurn P, Dal Poz MR, Stilwell B, Adams O. Imbalance in the health workforce. Human Resources for Health. 2004; 2:13. doi: 10.1186/1478-4491-2-13.
- [4] Joyce CM, Mc Neil J, Stoelwinder JU. Time for a new approach to medical workforce planning. Med J Aust. 2004;180:343–6.
- [5] Stokker JH, Gillian H. The right person, in the right job, with the right skills, at the right time. A workforce planning model that goes beyond metrics. Library Manag. 2009;30(8):561–71. doi: 10.1108/01435120911006520
- [6] Dr. E. Mubarak Ali and S. Abdul Aameed, "HRM Issues and Challenges in Healthcare" International Journal of Management (IJM), ISSN 0976 – 6502(Print), ISSN 0976 - 6510(Online), Volume 7, Issue 2, February (2016), pp. 165-176 © IAEME Publication.
- [7] El-Jardali F<sup>1</sup>, Tchaghchagian V, Jamal D. Assessment of human resources management practices in Lebanese hospitals. World Hosp Health Serv. 2010; 46(1):23-8.